Philippines: Extrajudicial killing of jurists as part of a pattern of widespread and systematic violations of human rights

Appendix

to the
Written Statement to the 42nd Session of the United Nations Human Rights Council by Lawyers’ Rights Watch Canada (LRWC) and Lawyers for Lawyers (L4L), NGOs in Special Consultative Status; and the Asian Legal Resource Centre (ALRC) and the International Association of Democratic Lawyers (IADL), NGOs in General Consultative Status.

Other organizations endorsing the statement are The Bar Human Rights Committee of England and Wales, the International Association of People’s Lawyers (IAPL), and the Philippines National Union of Peoples’ Lawyers (NUPL).

The statement is available at: https://www.lrwc.org/philippines-extrajudicial-killing-of-jurists-written-statement-to-the-hrc/

---

Jurists killed in the Philippines since July 2016 in date order of murder\(^1\) as of 29 July 2019

Forty-five jurists have been extrajudicially killed, of whom 41 are believed to have been killed as a result of their work as jurists.

1. **Rogelio Bato Jr**\(^2\)
   - Lawyer
   - 23 August 2016: Killed by unidentified gunmen in Barangay Lumbang 2, Tacloban City, Leyte
   - Investigation by local police
   - Perpetrators unidentified
   - Bato was the legal counsel of Mayor Espinosa in a 2014 murder case and has been

---

\(^1\) Sources include personal communications from human rights organizations as well as Jodesz Gavilan. LIST: Judges, prosecutors, lawyers killed under Duterte govt: Members of the judiciary are not spared from the culture of impunity, Rappler, 3rd Update, 21 May 2019, at https://www.rappler.com/newsbreak/iq/216239-list-judges-prosecutors-lawyers-killed-under-duterte-government.

confirmed by the Philippine National Police ("PNP") as being on its drugs watch list.

2. Allen Evasan
   - Lawyer
   - 23 August 2016: Shot dead outside his office in Iligan City, Lanao del Norte
   - Judge Arthur Abundiente believes that Evasan might have stepped on toes of powerful people.

3. Melver Tolentino
   - Lawyer; Legal consultant to the law-making body of Vigan City
   - 15 September 2016: Killed by unidentified men onboard a motorcycle in Magsingcal, Ilocos Sur
   - A special task group has been formed to investigate
   - Perpetrators unidentified
   - It is believed that the attack may have been related to a case Tolentino was handling.

4. Rolando Acido
   - City prosecutor
   - Former Department of Agrarian Reform lawyer who served the poorest of farmers in Davao Oriental
   - 26 October 2016: Gunned down by two men onboard a motorcycle in Davao Oriental, Mati City
   - Police are conducting pursuit operation against the suspects
   - Investigation pending
   - It is believed that Acido stepped on some powerful person's toes as a prosecutor or as a DAR lawyer.

5. Honorato Mazo
   - Lawyer
   - Former senior provincial lawyer with the Public Attorney's Office
   - 8 October 2016: Killed in his back yard in Matalam, North Cotabato
   - Perpetrators not identified
   - North Cotabato police suggest the killing could be related to his law practice.

---

6. **Jemar Apada**
   - Lawyer
   - 1 December 2016: Killed by a police officer in Diadi, Nueva Vizcaya
   - A suspect, Police Officer Clifford Dulnuan was detained three days after he allegedly shot and killed Apada
   - Prosecution pending
   - It is believed that Apada discovered his wife and Dulnuan were having an affair and Dulnan killed him.

7. **Arlan Castañeda**
   - Lawyer
   - Former municipal councillor of San Pablo town
   - 16 December 2016: Killed while attending Christmas mass in San Pablo, Isabela
   - Police believe that Castañeda's death could be related to his work on handling controversial land dispute case.

8. **Goering Paderanga Sr (father)**
   - Lawyer
   - 22 December 2016: Killed at law office in Cebu City
   - Suspect Jonathan Sanchez was identified by witnesses and arrested the next day
   - Prosecution pending
   - Sanchez has plead not guilty
   - Family members believe the attack was premeditated and unprovoked.

9. **Gerik Paderanga (son)**
   - Lawyer
   - 22 December 2016: Shot at law office in Cebu City and died 3 days later
   - Suspect Jonathan Sanchez was identified by witnesses and arrested the next day
   - Prosecution pending

---

- Sanchez has plead not guilty
- Family members believe the attack was premeditated and unprovoked.

10. **Johanne Noel Mingoa**

- Prosecutor
- 11 January 2017: Killed by unidentified gunmen in Old Balara, Commonwealth Avenue, Quezon City
- The Quezon City Police District (“QCPD”) has formed a special investigation task group (“SITG”) headed by its director, Chief Supt. Guillermo Lorenzo Eleazar, to look into the killing.
- Perpetrators unidentified
- Mingoa’s wife believes that his death could have been in respect to a “business transaction” related to his investments.
- Chief City Prosecutor Donald Lee said Mingoa handled a drug case around 3/4 years ago and that it could be work-related.

11. **Victor Canoy**

- Retired judge
- 2 February 2017: Shot dead in Surigao City
- Perpetrators unidentified
- Noel Pangilinan, president of the Integrated Bar of the Philippines (“IBP”) in Surigao del Norte, said lawyers in the province believed the Canoy’s death was related to the government’s war on drugs and that Canoy had been warned by a police source that his name appeared on a supposed list of protectors of the illegal drug trade after the drug cases they were handling had been dismissed.

12. **Mia Mascariñas Green**

- Environmental Lawyer
- 14 February 2017: Killed by 4 unidentified men in Bohol
- The murder was linked to a property dispute between Lloyd Lancer Gonzaga and his mother-in-law, Conrada Blomqvist, a client of Green
- Prosecution pending
- Green was the lawyer of one Conrada Blomqvist who sued Gonzaga over a land conflict in Panglao, Bohol. According to police, Gonzaga was linked to the murder

---

**Extrajudicial killing of jurists as part of a pattern of widespread & systematic violations of human rights:**

Jurists killed in the Philippines since July 2016 in date order of murder | Appendix

---


after being seen in a heated argument with Green in the courtroom. Sources believe that Gonzaga’s father has close ties with high-ranking government officials.

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>13.</td>
<td><strong>Diosdado Azarcon</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Prosecutor</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>22 May 2017: Gunned down by motorcycle-riding men in Caloocan City</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Motive unknown</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14.</td>
<td><strong>Elmer Mitra Jr</strong>¹⁴</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Lawyer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1 June 2017: Killed inside a moving vehicle in Manila</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Jessie Carlos, ex-policeman and the gunman behind the Resorts World Manila attack, was the &quot;main person of interest&quot; in the killing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Mitra’s father believes that he had connection with Carols and advised him to cut ties as Carols was allegedly involved in drugs.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15.</td>
<td><strong>Dolores Yumol</strong>¹⁵</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Lawyer; Bacoor City registrar</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>6 June 2017: Ambushed by unidentified gunmen in Las Piñas City</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>The Las Piñas police are investigating with assistance from Senior Supt. Christopher Olazo, the Bacoor police chief</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Perpetrators unidentified</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Motive unknown</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16.</td>
<td><strong>Maria Ronatay</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Assistant Prosecutor</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>18 July 2017: Killed when unidentified men opened fire at her car in Taytay, Rizal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Motive unknown.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17.</td>
<td><strong>Godofredo Abul Jr</strong>¹⁶</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Butuan City Judge</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>5 August 2017: Killed when unidentified men fired at his vehicle in Butuan City</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>The local police have created a task force to investigate the killing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Abul was subject to a six-month suspension due to an extortion allegation involving a drug case, this was denied by Abal.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

18. **Hermie Aban**²⁷
   - Lawyer; Served as an adviser to the city government’s Task Force Banat, an antidrug body
   - 5 August 2017: Killed by a gunman in Puerto Princesa City, Palawan
   - Perpetrators unidentified
   - Aban’s death is believed to be work-related as he handled high-profile and controversial cases in Palawan province, including several suspects in drug-related cases in Palawan and detained former Palawan governor Joel Reyes (facing murder charge for the 2011 killing of Dr. Gerry Ortega, an environmentalist and radio broadcaster who exposed alleged misuse of funds from the Malampaya natural gas project).

19. **Pablito Gahol**²⁸
   - Former prosecutor and barangay chairperson
   - 3 September 2017: Shot several times by unidentified men in Mandaluyong City
   - Perpetrators unidentified
   - Motive unknown
   - Eastern Police District (“EPD”) director Chief Superintendent Romulo Sapitula confirmed that Gahol was not on the EPD’s drug watchlist.

20. **Reymund Luna**²⁹
   - Quezon assistant provincial prosecutor
   - 29 September 2017: Gunned down by motorcycle-riding men in Infanta, Quezon
   - Justice Secretary Vitaliano Aguirre II has ordered the National Bureau of Investigation (“NBI”) to investigate the killing of Luna
   - Motive unknown

21. **Expectacion Baldeo**³⁰
   - Lawyer; Social Security System employee
   - 3 December 2017: Killed while manning her gasoline station in Tiaong, Quezon
   - Her husband was also killed in 2010
   - It is believed that Baldeo’s death could be work-related or due to a personal grudge.

22. **Jonah John Ungab**³¹

---


²¹ Another slain prosecutor becomes 10th killed since 2016, Interaksyon, 5 June 2018, at http://www.interaksyon.com/breaking-news/2018/06/05/128149/another-slain-prosecutor-becomes-10th-killed-
- Lawyer and vice mayor of Ronda, Cebu
- 19 February 2018: Killed when unidentified gunmen opened fire at his vehicle along S Osmeña Street, Cebu City
- The IBP have formed a task force to investigate the string of attacks on lawyers in recent years
- Perpetrators unidentified
- It is believed that Ungab’s death could be work-related as he was the lawyer for suspected drug lord Rolando Kerwin Espinosa Jr. and his father Rolando Espinosa Sr., which led him to be tagged as “drug protector” by Albuea police. Ungab was charged (subsequently dismissed) in respect to his relationship with Espinosa Jr.
- Ungab also served as counsel of suspected Danao City-based drug lord Alvaro “Barok” Alvaro, and controversial businessman Kenneth Dong who was tagged in the P6.4-billion shabu shipment confiscated by the Bureau of Customs.

23. **Henry Joseph Herrera**
- Lawyer
- 22 April 2018: Killed when his vehicle was ambushed by unidentified gunmen in Atimonan, Quezon
- Perpetrators unidentified
- Motive unknown

24. **Ramy Tagnong**
- Lawyer; Chief of the Calabarzon police legal affairs office
- 4 May 2018: Killed after being ambushed in vehicle in Antipolo City, Rizal
- A special task force led by Rizal PPO’s Senior Supt. Noli Bathan has been formed to investigate Tagnong’s killing.
- Perpetrators unidentified
- It is believed that Tagnong’s death may have been work-related as he was a legal officer who reviewed administrative cases of erring policemen.

25. **Rogelio Velasco**
- Assistant Prosecutor
- 11 May 2018: Killed after being ambushed in his vehicle at Don Antonio Heights,

---


Extradjudicial killing of jurists as part of a pattern of widespread & systematic violations of human rights:
Jurists killed in the Philippines since July 2016 in date order of murder | Appendix 7 of 15
Quezon City
- Investigation by local police; separate NBI investigation
- Three police officers, Mr. Lalimarmo, Mr. Lucy, and Mr. Mercado face murder allegations that are denied by the suspects
- NBI Death Investigation Division recommended murder charges against other unidentified individuals
- Prosecution pending
- Is believed that Velasco’s death could be related to his work as the city’s chief inquest prosecutor.

26. Geronimo Marabe Jr\(^{24}\)
- Retired prosecutor
- 22 May 2018: Killed by unidentified riding-in-tandem men in Ozamiz City
- Perpetrators unidentified
- He served as public prosecutor for several cases involving the Parojinog family who are currently detained on drug and illegal possession of firearms charges. Their parents, Ozamiz City mayor Reynaldo Parojinog Sr. (on the government's drug watchlist) and Susan Parojinog, were among the 15 persons killed in a raid on the Parojinog compound in Ozamiz on July 30, 2017.

27. Madonna Joy Ednaco Tanyag\(^{25}\)
- Assistant special prosecutor at the Office of the Ombudsman
- 4 June 2018: Stabbed in front of a lottery outlet along Visayas Avenue in Quezon City
- QCPD’s Criminal Investigation and Detection Unit
- Suspect Mr. Avenido was arrested but was killed after allegedly trying to snatch the gun of his police escort in July 2018. It is alleged that he robbed and killed Tanyag so he could get enough money for drugs
- Robbery and other motives are being investigated;
- It is not believed that Tanyag’s death was work-related.

28. Ricky Begino\(^{26}\)
- Judge
- 12 June 2018: Killed while on his way home in San Jose-Lagonoy, Camarines Sur

---


- Investigation by Philippines National Police
- Suspect Mr. Wilfredo Armea, was arrested the following day
- It is believed that Begino’s death was over a land dispute with his parents.

29. **Joey Galit**
   - Lawyer
   - 21 June 2018: Ambushed inside his subdivision in Cainta, Rizal
   - Senior Supt. Lou Evangelista, Rizal police director, has also formed a special task group to look into this case.
   - Perpetrators unidentified
   - It is believed that Galit’s death could be work-related as he handled sensitive cases in Cainta, Rizal province, and as far as Romblon and Palawan.

30. **Salvador Solima**
   - Lawyer; Former assistant city prosecutor, but was dismissed for gross misconduct and grave abuse of authority
   - 2 July 2018: Killed when unidentified gunmen barged into his home in Cebu City
   - Perpetrators unidentified
   - It is believed that Solima’s death could be work-related as he handled controversial cases, including those involving illegal drugs.

31. **Rafael Atutubo**
   - Lawyer
   - 23 August 2018: Gunned down by unidentified men wearing bonnets in Bacolod City
   - Foreign lawyers from United States, Belgium, South Korea, and Japan also had a dialogue with the IBP
   - Office had formed a SITG to investigate and speed up the resolution of the Atotubo case, but no suspect has been charged until now
   - Perpetrators unidentified
   - The delegation is expected to present its findings to international lawyer organizations and one of the agencies of the UN

---


- It is believed that Atutubo’s death could be work-related as he worked as a defense attorney of illegal drug suspects. Reportedly, he was advised to get a bodyguard as he was handling drug related cases.
- Atutubo was an advocate against corruption in the judiciary and the police.

32. **Connie Villamor**
   - Lawyer
   - 24 September 2018: Killed by unidentified gunmen while onboard her vehicle in Tagum City, Davao del Norte
     A SITG of Davao del Norte PNP has been set up
   - It is believed that Villamor’s death could be work-related or a personal grudge.

33. **Edeljulio Romero**
   - Lawyer
   - 28 September 2018: Gunned down in Barangay Culasi in Roxas City, Capiz
   - It is believed that Romero’s death could be work-related as he was the lawyer of alleged drug lord Melvin Odicta Sr. and other drug-personalities.
   - Police Regional Office-6 Director, Chief Superintendent John Bulalalaco confirmed that Romero was considered a high value target Level 3 drug personality.

34. **Edmundo Pintac**
   - Judge
   - 8 October 2018: Shot dead by motorcycle-riding suspects in Barangay Banadero in Ozamiz City
   - PNP has created a SITG to investigate
   - Local police told Rappler that the Parojinog siblings are now persons of interest in the killing of Mr. Pintac
   - It is believed that Pintac’s death could be work-related as he was the judge that handled the drug and firearms cases against Ozamiz Vice Mayor Nova Princess Parojinog and her brother Reynaldo Parojinog Jr before these cases were transferred to a Quezon City court earlier in 2018 and other high-profile cases that he was handling prior to his death.

35. **Benjamin Ramos**

---

- Lawyer; Secretary-general of the Negros Occidental arm of the National Union of Peoples' Lawyers; Human rights defender
- 6 November 2018: Shot dead by riding-in-tandem assailants in Kabankalan City
- Lawyer Johannes Gaasheek from the Netherlands led the team that is looking into the death
- Foreign lawyers from United States, Belgium, South Korea, and Japan also had a dialogue with the IBP
- Investigation on the Ramos case is ongoing
- The delegation is expected to present its findings to international lawyer organizations and one of the agencies of the UN
- It is believed that Ramos’ death could be work-related as he had previously provided legal assistance to the families of the victims of the ‘Sagay 9 massacre’, which involved the killing of nine sugarcane farmers from the National Federation of Sugar Workers by unidentified armed men on 20 October 2018 in Negros Occidental and other cases relating to poor clients whose families have been targeted by the police, soldiers and death squads associated with the president’s drug war.
- The National Union of People’s Lawyers have said Ramos’ work had angered local policemen and the military.
- Ramos’ picture was included by local police in a list of people accused of having ties to the underground communist movement, a claim that the group has been denied.

36. **Laban, Nasser M.**
   - Lawyer and peace advocate
   - December 2018: Shot dead by an unidentified gunman while inside a passenger van traveling from Tacurong City to Cotabato City Maguindanao
   - Motive not known.

37. **Batocabe, Rodel**
   - Lawyer and Congressman running for mayor of the town of Daraga
   - 22 December 2018: Shot dead by two men at Daraga Town, Albay, Luzon
   - Philippine National Police alleged that the incumbent mayor Carlwyn Baldo was the mastermind of the killing, which the suspect denies. Police charged Mr. Baldo with the murder 22 December 2019;
   - Arrest warrant for the suspect issued May 2019, but not served due to possible...
evasion of service by the suspect.

38. **Mary Ann Castro**
   - Prosecutor (formerly in Cebu City and recently transferred to Masbate City)
   - 17 January 2019: Ambushed and shot dead while driving Cebu City.
   - Police indicate possible motives ranged from personal grudge, family conflict, her work as prosecutor or her involvement with a person linked to illegal drugs.

39. **Chairmaine Pelalyo Mejia**
   - Lawyer
   - 26 March 2019: Stabbed to death by an unidentified assailant after getting out of her car in front of an apartment-hotel in Las Piñas City, Metro Manila, where she had agreed to meet someone: suspect fled on a motorcycle
   - Police interviewed in newspaper indicated robbery as possible motive.

40. **Rex Jasper Lopoz**
   - Lawyer
   - 13 March 2019: Unidentified gunmen shot Lopez outside a shopping mall in Tagum City
   - Investigators believe that a sniper positioned several meters away killed Lopez
   - Perpetrators unidentified
   - Lopoz’s family believe that his death could be work-related as he was representing defendants in drug cases and that his murder was linked to the Duterte administration’s war on drugs.

41. **Reymar Lacaya**
   - Judge
   - 9 May 2019: Gunman shot Lacaya on his way home to a neighbouring town in Mindanao from the courthouse

---


42. **Val Crisostomo**
   - Lawyer
   - 17 May 2019: shot dead by a gunman who fired several shots at him in front of the Justice Hall in Bonuan Tondaligan Dagupan City.

43. **Adilberto Golla Jr**
   - Lawyer
   - 17 May 2019: shot dead while he was on his way to work near his home in Rodriguez, Rizal
   - Defense council for 10 policemen included in the dozens accused in the 2009 “Mindanao massacre”
   - Two police in the Rodriguez police force officers were arrested 7 July 2019 based on a search warrant issued by Judge Cynthia Mariño-Ricablanca of Santa Cruz, Laguna province, after police investigators found security camera footage allegedly implicating the two officers.

44. **Anthony H. Trinidad**
   - Lawyer
   - 23 July 2019: Ambushed and shot by motorcycle-riding assailants in Guihulngan City, Negros Oriental, while traveling from a court hearing in La Libertad town in Negros Oriental to his home in San Carlos City, Negros Occidental. His wife also suffered a gunshot wound during the attack.
   - Guihulngan Police Chief Bonifacio Tecson said police were investigating the killing as work-related or motivated by personal grudge. He revealed that Trinidad handled sensitive drug cases and that he had been receiving death threats for several months before the attack. “He was tagged as a supporter of the New People’s Army (NPA).” Trinidad had informed the Guihulngan police that he received a letter with an alleged list of people targeted for supporting the NPA. He requested security assistance,

---

which the police provided whenever he attended a hearing, Tecson said. On 26 July, Justice Secretary Menardo Guevarra directed the National Bureau of Investigation (NBI) to investigate the killing, reportedly stating that there are “no other specific instructions except to get the killers.”

45. **Nicolas Gomez**
   - Lawyer
   - 28 July 2019: Was gunned down by to motor-cycle riding assailants at Barangay Poblacion in Valencia City, Bukidnon province
   - He was supposed to attend a hearing in Malaybalay city on July 29th, 2019
   - According to Valencia police chief Col. Surki Sereñas, suspects aboard an XRM motorcycle which had no license plate
   - Col. Sereñas said police have identified the gunmen, but their identities have not been disclosed.
   - Initial investigation indicates Gomez was supposed to attend a hearing on land cases in Malaybalay City in which he is the complainant.

**Other murders, attempted murders and abduction-disappearance**

In addition to the above-named persons, the following three legal workers have been murdered:

- **Randel Villaruz**, Clerk of regional trial court, murdered 1 October 2018 at Batac City, Ilocos Norte, Luzon;
- **Edwin Pura**, paralegal, murdered 26 October 2017 at Gubat, Sorsogon, Luzon;
- **Mariam Uy Acob**, paralegal, murdered 23 September 2018 at Mamasapano, Maguindanao, Mindanao.

The following lawyer has been abducted and disappeared:

- **Alwyn Mendoza**, lawyer, abducted and disappeared 23 February 2019 at Cabanatuan City, Nueva Ecija, Luzon.

The following seven jurists have survived murderous attacks:

- **Nasser Abinal**, lawyer, attacked 5 May 2017 in Quiapo, Metro Manila;

---

- Ron Ely Esponsa, lawyer, attacked August 2017 in Sorsogon City, Sorsogon, Luzon;
- Argel Cabatbat, lawyer, attacked 13 February 2018 in Quezon City, Metro Manila;
- Wilmer Donasco, lawyer, attacked 26 September 2018 in Ecoland, Davao City, Mindanao;
- Erfe Del Castillo, lawyer, attacked 22 December 2018 in Talisay City, Negros Occidental;
- Manuel Tesiorna, prosecutor, attacked 6 February 2017 at Surigao City, Surigao del Norte, Mindanao;
- Jesephone C. Olivar, prosecutor, attacked 10 June 2019