# Lawyers' Rights Watch Canada

NGO in Special Consultative Status with the Economic and Social Council of the United Nations

www.lrwc.org; lrwc@portal.ca; Tel: +1 604 738 0338; Fax: +1 604 736 1175

3220 West 13 Avenue, Vancouver, B.C. CANADA V6K 2V5

## Killing the lawyers: 43 jurists murdered in the Philippines since 2016

Extrajudicial killing of jurists as part of a pattern of widespread and systematic violations of human rights

#### Report Lawyers' Rights Watch Canada 5 July 2019

#### **Contents**

1.	Introduction	1
2.	The Philippines' persistent pattern of gross and systematic human rights violations	3
3.	International law obligations	4
4.	National legal obligations	4
5.	Systematic impunity for extrajudicial killings	5
6.	Conclusion and recommendations	5
App	pendix: Jurists killed in the Philippines since July 2016 in date order of murder	7

#### 1. Introduction

Since 30 June 2016, the Government of the Philippines has engaged in a continuing, gross, and systematic campaign of extrajudicial killing in violation of the Philippines' international law obligations. Since President Rodrigo Duterte (President Duterte) took office on 30 June 2016, an estimated 27,000<sup>1</sup> persons, including children,<sup>2</sup> have been extrajudicially killed with impunity, as part of a "war on drugs." The Philippines' official number is 6,600.<sup>3</sup> Among the victims are 43 lawyers, prosecutors and judges (jurists) assassinated between August 2016 and May 2019 and numerous human rights defenders (defenders). This pattern of gross and systematic violations contravenes the Philippines' obligation to prevent and remedy violations of the right to life. The widespread murders of jurists also causes violations of the rights to legal representation and a fair trial.

<sup>\*&</sup>quot;The first thing we do, let's kill all the lawyers," said the rebel plotter, Dick the Butcher, in Shakespeare's play, *Henry VI*.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> OHCHR, High Commissioner Bachelet calls on States to take strong action against inequalities, 6 March 2019, at https://www.ohchr.org/EN/NewsEvents/Pages/DisplayNews.aspx?NewsID=24265&LangID=E.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Human Rights Watch, Philippines: 'Drug War' Devastates Children's Lives, 27 June 2019, at https://www.hrw.org/news/2019/06/27/philippines-drug-war-devastates-childrens-lives.

In only five cases are suspects in custody or charges pending against a suspect. In the remaining cases there appears to have been no effective investigation or minimal progress on investigations. In addition to the 43 jurists murdered, eight lawyers have survived murderous attacks, and one has been abducted and disappeared. A court worker and two paralegals are also among those extrajudicially killed. A list of the 43 jurists with dates of death and status of investigations as of 10 June 2019 is found in the Appendix to this report.

United Nations (UN) bodies and experts, including the UN High Commissioner for Human Rights (UNHCHR) have reported gross and systematic violations of human rights by the Republic of the Philippines while a member of the Human Rights Council (Council).<sup>4</sup> The Philippines has failed to "uphold the highest standards in the promotion and protection of human rights," and to "fully cooperate with the Council," as required by General Assembly (GA) Resolution 60/251, and has persistently disregarded recommendations of UN Treaty Bodies, Universal Periodic Reviews (UPR) and UN human rights experts. The Philippines has failed to respond to communications or requests for visits from Special Procedures concerned with civil and political rights. The Philippines has vilified the Special Rapporteur on Extrajudicial Killings conducted reprisals against the UN Special Rapporteur on the Rights of Indigenous Peoples, and threatened the International Criminal Court (ICC) Prosecutor with arrest after she opened a preliminary examination of alleged crimes against humanity in the context of the "war on drugs" The Council's authority is undermined by the Philippines' continued membership in the face of its persistent, unremedied, gross and systematic violations of fundamental human rights.

LRWC provides recommendations in section 6 below seeking Council action to ensure cessation and accountability of the Philippines for extrajudicial killings and other gross human rights violations. Recommendations include creation of an international independent investigation into rights violations in the Philippines since 2016 and a Council recommendation to the GA to suspend the Philippines' Council participation pursuant to GA

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> The Philippines was re-elected in October 2018 on a blank state, as a member of the UN Human Rights Council for a three year term commencing January 20169 and re-elected for another term ending 31 December 2021.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> Human Rights Council: resolution / adopted by the General Assembly, 3 April 2006, A/RES/60/251, http://www.refworld.org/docid/4537814814.html.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> Report of the Working Group on the Universal Periodic Review, Philippines Addendum, Views on conclusions and/or recommendations, voluntary commitments and replies presented by the State under review, 19 September 2017, A/HRC/36/12/Add, para 8 (a), at https://undocs.org/en/A/HRC/36/12/Add.1.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> Overview of activities undertaken by the mandate since 1 March 2018, including observations on communications transmitted between 1 March 2018 and 28 February 2019 and replies received between 1 May 2018 and 30 April 2019: Report of the Special Rapporteur on extrajudicial, summary or arbitrary executions, A/HRC/41/36/Add.1, para 14, at https://undocs.org/A/HRC/41/36/Add.1

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> See e.g. Request for country visit by the Special Rapporteur on Human Rights Defenders, https://www.ohchr.org/EN/Issues/SRHRDefenders/Pages/CountryVisits.aspx.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> UN OHCHR, Press briefing note on Attacks/threats by States against UN human rights experts, 21 November 2017, at

https://www.ohchr.org/EN/NewsEvents/Pages/DisplayNews.aspx?NewsID=22421&LangID=E

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>10</sup> OHCHR, The Philippines: Renewed allegations against UN expert are "clearly retaliation", 1 May 2019, at https://www.ohchr.org/en/NewsEvents/Pages/DisplayNews.aspx?NewsID=24538&LangID=E

Resolution 60/251. Also recommended are Council reforms to ensure that members fulfil GA Resolution 60/251.

## 2. The Philippines' persistent pattern of gross and systematic human rights violations

Since President Duterte declared the "war on drugs" there have been widespread and systematic rights violations including extrajudicial killing of thousands of people. Human rights defenders, including lawyers, judges, land and environmental rights defenders, journalists, civil society and labour activists, and other advocates (defenders) have been targeted. President Duterte has repeatedly threatened to kill defenders.<sup>11</sup>

In December 2018, the ICC Prosecutor<sup>12</sup> noted that:

The UN Secretary General, UN bodies and experts, various States, international NGOs and national civil society representatives have expressed serious concern about the alleged extrajudicial killings and criticised statements by President Duterte which have been viewed as endorsing the killings and fostering an environment of impunity and violence."

In March 2019, the UNHCHR estimated that "up to 27,000 people may have been killed in the context of the campaign against illegal drugs since mid-2016." On 7 June 2019, eleven UN Special Procedures mandate holders issued a statement calling on the UN for an independent investigation to address the "staggering number of unlawful deaths and police killings in the context of the so-called war on drugs, as well as killings of human rights defenders," noting that independent UN human rights experts have raised these concerns with the Philippines on "33 occasions over the last three years." On 24 June 2019, the UNHCHR welcomed the 7 June statement, reiterating concern that "persistent reports of extrajudicial killings—in the context of campaigns against drug use continue."

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>11</sup> See "I'll Kill You Along with Other Drug Addicts: President Duterte's War on Human Rights Defenders, FIDH, OMCT within the framework of Protect Defenders.eu, February 2019 at p. 9 and footnotes 28 to 31, at http://www.omct.org/human-rights-defenders/reports-and-publications/philippines/2019/02/d25257/.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>12</sup> Statement of the Prosecutor of the International Criminal Court, Fatou Bensouda concerning the situation in the Republic of the Philippines 13 October 2016, at https://www.icc-cpi.int/pages/item.aspx?name=161013-otp-stat-php.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>13</sup> The International Criminal Court Office of the Prosecutor Report on Preliminary Examination Activities 2018,

<sup>5</sup> December 2018 at para. 50, at https://www.icc-cpi.int/itemsDocuments/181205-rep-otp-PE-ENG.pdf

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>14</sup> OHCHR, High Commissioner Bachelet calls on States to take strong action against inequalities, 6 March 2019, at https://www.ohchr.org/EN/NewsEvents/Pages/DisplayNews.aspx?NewsID=24265&LangID=E.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>15</sup> OHCHR, UN human rights experts call for independent probe into Philippines violations, 7 June 2019, at https://www.ohchr.org/EN/NewsEvents/Pages/DisplayNews.aspx?NewsID=24679&LangID=E

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>16</sup> Human Rights Council, Opening statement by UN High Commissioner for Human Rights Michelle Bachelet, 41<sup>st</sup> session of the Human Rights Council, 24 June 2019, at

#### 3. International law obligations

These extrajudicial killings represent a continuing pattern of gross and systematic violations that contravene the Philippines' obligations arising from national and international law, including the Universal Declaration of Human Rights (UDHR), the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights (ICCPR) and other international human rights instruments, including the UN Declaration on Human Rights Defenders<sup>17</sup> and the UN Basic Principles on the Role of Lawyers.<sup>18</sup>

The Philippines' persistent, gross and systematic abuses violate the responsibilities it has accepted as a member of the Council as set out in GA Resolution 60/251.

The right to life is guaranteed by a number of international law treaties and instruments. Article 3 of the UDHR set out that "Everyone has the right to life, liberty and security of person." The ICCPR Article 6 guarantees: "Every human being has the inherent right to life. This right shall be protected by law. No one shall be arbitrarily deprived of his life No derogation from this rights is allowed under any circumstances, as set out in Article 4. ." Article 2 requires all ratifying states to take effective measure to protect the right to life and provide remedies for rights violations.

The obligation of the Philippines's to ensure the right to life includes the duty to conduct investigations of all extrajudicial killings. Extrajudicially executed persons and surviving family members have a right to remedies including effective investigation by the State. Such investigations must be prompt, effective, thorough, independent, impartial, and transparent in accordance with the 2016 UN Minnesota Protocol on the Investigation of Potentially Unlawful Death (Minnesota Protocol). When the investigated death is apparently a homicide, the State has a duty to conduct prosecutions and trials to identify and punish perpetrators. Failure by a State to investigate the suspected the unlawful death of a resident and hold the perpetrators accountable is itself a violation of the right to life. <sup>20</sup>

#### 4. National legal obligations

The Constitution of the Republic of the Philippines (Constitution) "adopts the generally accepted principles of international law as part of the law of the land" (Article II, section 2) and "guarantees full respect for human rights" (Article II, section 11). The Bill of Rights Article III section 1, stipulates that, "No person shall be deprived of life, liberty, or property without due process of law, nor shall any person be denied the equal protection of the laws."

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>17</sup> UN General Assembly, *Declaration on the Right and Responsibility of Individuals, Groups and Organs of Society to Promote and Protect Universally Recognized Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms: resolution / adopted by the General Assembly*, 8 March 1999, A/RES/53/144, available at: https://www.refworld.org/docid/3b00f54c14.html.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>18</sup> United Nations, *Basic Principles on the Role of Lawyers*, 7 September 1990, available at: https://www.refworld.org/docid/3ddb9f034.html.

<sup>19</sup> The Minnesota Protocol on the Investigation of Potentially Unlawful Death (2016), OHCHR,, New York/Geneva, 2017, pp. 7-8, including footnote references, at

https://www.ohchr.org/Documents/Publications/MinnesotaProtocol.pdf.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>20</sup> UN General Assembly, Report of the Special Rapporteur on extrajudicial, summary or arbitrary executions, Christof Heyns A70/304, 7 August 2015

The Supreme Court of the Philippines has invoked the ICCPR and ruled that treaties to which the Philippines is a party have the force and effect of law in the Philippines.<sup>21</sup>

On 3 June 2019, the Philippines passed the Human Rights Defenders Protection law to prevent human rights violations against defenders. This law is based on the UN Declaration on Human Rights Defenders and the Model National Law on the Recognition and Protection of Human Rights Defenders.<sup>22</sup>

#### 5. Systematic impunity for extrajudicial killings

Despite the Philippines' international and national legal obligations, President Duterte utilises "drug lists" to "red-tag" defenders with whom the Duterte administration disagrees, including lawyers representing those accused of drug crimes. Through these lists defenders are publicly named, vilified as public enemies and subjected to a high probability of being assassinated. "Red-tagging" of people has resulted in "harassment, surveillance, loss of employment and killing."

The Duterte administration has made failure to investigate a matter of policy. On 24 July 2018, President Duterte stated he would not allow the Commission on Human Rights or Ombudsman to investigate alleged human rights violations committed by police or military without his permission. This approval requirement impairs the ability of authorities to conduct prompt, effective, independent and impartial, and transparent investigations in accordance with national and international human rights law. In the small number of cases where investigations have been conducted, publicly available information is minimal and no reports are made. Few suspects have been identified by investigations or held accountable through prosecution and trial.

#### 6. Conclusion and recommendations

LRWC requests the Council to insist and ensure that the Philippines:

- a. Take all necessary measures to prevent and remedy extrajudicial killings;
- b. Cease publicly vilifying or 'red tagging' jurists, defenders and other individuals;
- c. Publicly denounce all attacks against jurists and defenders and announce that perpetrators will be held accountable;
- d. Conduct independent, impartial investigations of all extrajudicial killings in accordance with the 2016 Minnesota Protocol;
- e. Implement the 3 June 2019 Human Rights Defenders Protection law;
- f. Cooperate with the UNHCHR and mechanisms of the Council including by facilitating country visits, providing unrestricted access to all areas and witnesses, and

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>21</sup> Tañadsa v Angara, G.R. No. 118295 May 2, 1997

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>22</sup> International Service for Human Rights, Model National Law on the Recognition and Protection of Human Rights Defenders, 2016, at

https://academy.ishr.ch/upload/resources and tools/ishr Model Law for the recognition and protection of h uman rights defenders en.pdf.

- preventing and refraining from all acts of interference, intimidation or reprisals against UN monitors;
- g. Remedy violations identified by UN human rights monitoring bodies;
- h. Uphold its international law obligations to promote and protect human rights and to fully cooperate with Council;

#### LRWC also requests that the Council:

- i. Provide an urgent mandate to the OHCHR to monitor and report to the Council on the human rights situation in the Philippines as an initial step toward establishment of an independent international investigation into extrajudicial killings and other human rights violations;
- j. Recommend to the GA steps to be taken to remedy the failure of the Philippines to comply with GA Resolution 60/251, Article 9, including consideration of suspension of the Philippines from Council membership; k. In consultation with civil society, <sup>23</sup> adopt policies and procedures for the
- election of Council members, monitoring and reporting on their compliance with GA Resolution 60/251 during membership and, as a last resort, suspension for persistent gross, systematic, and persistent noncompliance.

https://www.ishr.ch/sites/default/files/documents/hrc membership report web.pdf.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>23</sup> Amnesty International, Human Rights Watch and International Service for Human Rights, From the Ground Up: Opportunities for Strengthening and Leveraging Membership of the UN Human Rights Council. Report of a one-day dialogue, held on 5 February 2019, at

#### **Appendix:**

## Jurists killed in the Philippines since July 2016 in date order of murder<sup>24</sup>

#### **As of 10 June 2019**

## 1. Rogelio Bato Jr<sup>25</sup>

- Lawyer
- 23 August 2016: Killed by unidentified gunmen in Barangay Lumbang 2, Tacloban City, Leyte
- Investigation by local police
- Perpetrators unidentified
- Bato was the legal counsel of Mayor Espinosa in a 2014 murder case and has been confirmed by the Philippine National Police ("PNP") as being on its drugs watch list.

## 2. Allen Evasan<sup>26</sup>

Lawyer

23 August 2016: Shot dead outside his office in Iligan City, Lanao del Norte Judge Arthur Abundiente believes that Evasan might have stepped on toes of powerful people.

#### 3. Melver Tolentino<sup>27</sup>

Lawyer; Legal consultant to the law-making body of Vigan City15 September 2016: Killed by unidentified men onboard a motorcycle in Magsingcal, Ilocos Sur A special task group has been formed to investigate Perpetrators unidentified

It is believed that the attack may have been related to a case Tolentino was handling.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>24</sup> Sources include personal communications from human rights organizations as well as Jodesz Gavilan. LIST: Judges, prosecutors, lawyers killed under Duterte gov't: Members of the judiciary are not spared from the culture of impunity, Rappler, 3rd Update, 21 May 2019, at https://www.rappler.com/newsbreak/iq/216239-list-judges-prosecutors-lawyers-killed-under-duterte-government.

Ohn Kevin D. Pilapil. Albuera town mayor's lawyer, minor shot dead, SunStar Philippines, 24 August 2016, at https://www.sunstar.com.ph/article/93913; Philippines News Agency. Justice for girl killed with lawyer, Manila Times, 25 August 2016, at https://www.manilatimes.net/justice-for-girl-killed-with-lawyer/282087/ Richel v. Umel. Lawyer shot dead in Iligan City, SunStar Philippines, 24 August 2016, at https://www.sunstar.com.ph/article/94142

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>27</sup> Bryan Realgo. Lawyer shot dead in Ilocos Sur, ABS-CBN News, 16 September 2016, at https://news.abs-cbn.com/news/09/16/16/lawyer-shot-dead-in-ilocos-sur; Ivy C. Tejano. Mati City prosecutor shot dead, SunStar Philippines, 27 October 2016, at https://www.sunstar.com.ph/article/106433

#### 4. Rolando Acido<sup>28</sup>

- City prosecutor
- Former Department of Agrarian Reform lawyer who served the poorest of farmers in Davao Oriental
- 6 July 2019: Gunned down by two men onboard a motorcycle in Davao Oriental, Mati City
- Police are conducting pursuit operation against the suspects
- Investigation pending
- It is believed that Acido stepped on some powerful person's toes as a prosecutor or as a DAR lawyer.

#### 5. Honorato Mazo<sup>29</sup>

- Lawyer
- Former senior provincial lawyer with the Public Attorney's Office
- 8 October 2016: Killed in his back yard in Matalam, North Cotabato
- Perpetrators not identified
- North Cotabato police suggest the killing could be related to his law practice.

## 6. Jemar Apada<sup>30</sup>

- Lawyer
- 1 December 2016: Killed by a police officer in Diadi, Nueva Vizcaya
- A suspect, Police Officier Clifford Dulnuan was detained three days after he allegedly shot and killed Apada
- Prosecution pending
- It is believed that Apada discovered his wife and Dulnuan were having an affair and Dulnan killed him.

## 7. Arlan Castañeda<sup>31</sup>

- Lawyer
- Former municipal councillor of San Pablo town
- 16 December 2016: Killed while attending Christmas mass in San Pablo, Isabela

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>28</sup> Ivy C. Tejano. Mati City prosecutor shot dead, SunStar Philippines, 27 October 2016, at https://www.sunstar.com.ph/article/106433; Mart Sambalud. Slain Tagum lawyer was victim of impunity, says brother, News Info, 15 March 2019, at https://newsinfo.inquirer.net/1096048/slain-tagum-lawyer-was-victim-of-impunity-says-brother.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>29</sup> Lawyer shot dead in North Cotabato, Philstar, 8 October 2016, at https://www.philstar.com/nation/2016/10/08/1631553/lawyer-shot-dead-north-cotabato#tw2o2fpYkiqIXZih.99. <sup>30</sup> Villamor Visaya Jr. Nueva Vizcaya cop who killed lawyer surrenders to Ifugao police, 5 December 2019, at https://newsinfo.inquirer.net/850839/nueva-vizcaya-cop-who-killed-lawyer-surrenders-to-ifugao-police?utm\_expid=.XqNwTug2W6nwDVUSgFJXed.1; Raymund Catindig. Cops face raps over lawyer slay, 24 December 2016, at https://www.philstar.com/nation/2016/12/24/1656299/cops-face-raps-over-lawyer-slay <sup>31</sup> Lawyer shot dead inside church, The Manila Times, 20 December 2016, at https://www.manilatimes.net/lawyer-shot-dead-inside-church/302872/; Public Statement - The Law Society of Upper Canada expresses grave concern about the murder of lawyer Arlan Castañeda in the Philippines, Newswire, 24 February 2017, at https://www.newswire.ca/news-releases/public-statement---the-law-society-of-upper-canada-expresses-grave-concern-about-the-murder-of-lawyer-arlan-castaneda-in-the-philippines-614721424.html.

- Police believe that Castañeda's death could be related to his work onhandling controversial land dispute case.

## 8. Goering Paderanga Sr (father)<sup>32</sup>

- Lawyer
- 22 December 2016: Killed at law office in Cebu City
- Suspect Jonathan Sanchez was identified by witnesses and arrested the next day
- Prosecution pending
- Sanchez has plead not guilty
- Family members believe the attack was premeditated and unprovoked.

## 9. Gerik Paderanga (son)<sup>33</sup>

- Lawyer
- 22 December 2016: Shot at law office in Cebu City and died 3 days later
- Suspect Jonathan Sanchez was identified by witnesses and arrested the next day
- Prosecution pending
- Sanchez has plead not guilty
- Family members believe the attack was premeditated and unprovoked.

## **10.** Johanne Noel Mingoa<sup>34</sup>

- Prosecutor
- 11 January 2017: Killed by unidentified gunmen in Old Balara, Commonwealth Avenue, Quezon City
- The Quezon City Police District ("QCPD") has formed a special investigation task group ("SITG") headed by its director, Chief Supt. Guillermo Lorenzo Eleazar, to look into the killing.
- Perpetrators unidentified
- Mingoa's wife believes that his death could have been in respect to a "business transaction" related to his investments.
- Chief City Prosecutor Donald Lee said Mingoa handled a drug case around 3/4 years ago and that it could be work-related.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>32</sup> Firm execs face trial over 'untruthful statement', SunStar, 16 February 2018, at https://www.sunstar.com.ph/article/419401; Cebu lawyer, pa killed in shooting incidents over parking dispute, Inquirer.net, 26 December 2016, at https://newsinfo.inquirer.net/856782/lawyers-son-dies-3-days-after-shooting-incident-over-parking-dispute?utm\_expid=.XqNwTug2W6nwDVUSgFJXed.; Paderanga shooting 'planned', SunStar, 29 December 2016, at https://www.sunstar.com.ph/article/117886.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>33</sup> Firm execs face trial over 'untruthful statement', SunStar, 16 February 2018, at https://www.sunstar.com.ph/article/419401.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>34</sup> QC prosecutor shot dead; cops tag 3 persons of interest, Inquirer.net, 12 January 2017, at https://newsinfo.inquirer.net/861571/qc-prosecutor-shot-dead-cops-tag-3-persons-of-interest; Probe of couple's slay looks into wife's gov't job, Inquirer.net, 16 June 2017, at https://newsinfo.inquirer.net/905978/probe-of-couples-slay-looks-into-wifes-govt-job.

## 11. Victor Canoy<sup>35</sup>

- Retired judge
- 2 February 2017: Shot dead in Surigao City
- Perpetrators unidentified
- Noel Pangilinan, president of the Integrated Bar of the Philippines ("**IBP**") in Surigao del Norte, said lawyers in the province believed the Canoy's death was related to the government's war on drugs and that Canoy had been warned by a police source that his name appeared on a supposed list of protectors of the illegal drug trade after the drug cases they were handling had been dismissed.

#### 12. Mia Mascariñas Green<sup>36</sup>

- Environmental Lawyer
- 14 February 2017: Killed by 4 unidentified men in Bohol
- The murder was linked to a property dispute between Lloyd Lancer Gonzaga and his mother-in-law, Conrada Blomqvist, a client of Green
- Prosecution pending
- Green was the lawyer of one Conrada Blomqvist who sued Gonzaga over a land conflict in Panglao, Bohol. According to police, Gonzaga was linked to the murder after being seen in a heated argument with Green in the courtroom. Sources believe that Gonzaga's father has close ties with high-ranking government officials.

#### 13. Diosdado Azarcon

- Prosecutor
- 22 May 2017: Gunned down by motorcycle-riding men in Caloocan City
- Motive unknown

#### 14. Elmer Mitra Jr<sup>37</sup>

- Lawyer
- 1 June 2017: Killed inside a moving vehicle in Manila
- Jessie Carlos, ex-policeman and the gunman behind the Resorts World Manila attack, was the "main person of interest" in the killing
- Mitra's father believes that he had connection with Carols and advised him to cut ties as Carols was allegedly involved in drugs.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>35</sup> Surigao lawyers won't touch drug cases, Inquirer.net, 9 February 2017, at https://newsinfo.inquirer.net/869629/surigao-lawyers-wont-touch-drug-cases.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>36</sup> Main suspect in environment lawyer's killing arrested, Inquirer.net, 3 July 2017, at https://newsinfo.inquirer.net/910426/main-suspect-in-environment-lawyers-killing-arrested?utm\_expid=.XqNwTug2W6nwDVUSgFJXed.1; Environmental lawyer Mia Mascariñas-Green to be laid to rest, Inquirer.net, 20 February 2017, at https://newsinfo.inquirer.net/873427/environmental-lawyer-mia-mascarinas-green-to-be-laid-to-rest.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>37</sup> Resorts World gunman behind murder of cop-turned-casino financier?, Philstar, 8 June 2017, at https://www.philstar.com/headlines/2017/06/08/1708204/resorts-world-gunman-behind-murder-cop-turned-casino-financier.

#### 15. Dolores Yumol<sup>38</sup>

- Lawyer; Bacoor City registrar
- 6 June 2017: Ambushed by unidentified gunmen in Las Piñas City
- The Las Piñas police are investigating with assistance from Senior Supt. Christopher Olazo, the Bacoor police chief
- Perpetrators unidentified
- Motive unknown

#### 16. Maria Ronatay

- Assistant Prosecutor
- 18 July 2017: Killed when unidentified men opened fire at her car in Taytay, Rizal
- Motive unknown.

#### 17. Godofredo Abul Jr<sup>39</sup>

- Butuan City Judge
- 5 August 2017: Killed when unidentified men fired at his vehicle in Butuan City
- The local police have created a task force to investigate the killing
- Abul was subject to a six-month suspension due to an extortion allegation involving a drug case, this was denied by Abal.

## 18. Hermie Aban<sup>40</sup>

- Lawyer; Served as an adviser to the city government's Task Force Banat, an antidrug body
- 5 August 2017: Killed by a gunman in Puerto Princesa City, Palawan
- Perpetrators unidentified
- Aban's death is believed to be work-related as he handled high-profile and controversial cases in Palawan province, including several suspects in drug-related cases in Palawan and detained former Palawan governor Joel Reyes (facing murder charge for the 2011 killing of Dr. Gerry Ortega, an environmentalist and radio broadcaster who exposed the alleged misuse of funds from the Malampaya natural gas project).

https://newsinfo.inquirer.net/923006/lawyer-handling-drug-cases-shot-dead-in-palawan.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>38</sup> Probe of couple's slay looks into wife's gov't job, Inquirer.net, 16 June 2017, at https://newsinfo.inquirer.net/905978/probe-of-couples-slay-looks-into-wifes-govt-job.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>39</sup> SC justices express outrage over killing of Butuan judge, Rappler, 6 August 2017, at https://www.rappler.com/nation/177832-supreme-court-outrage-judge-killed-butuan?utm\_source=twitter&utm\_medium=social&utm\_campaign=nation; IBP condemns killing of RTC Judge Godofredo Abul Jr., Inquirer.net, 6 August 2017, at https://newsinfo.inquirer.net/920807/ibp-godofredo-abul-jr. <sup>40</sup> Lawyer handling drug cases shot dead in Palawan, Inquirer.net, 16 August 2017, at

#### 19. Pablito Gahol<sup>41</sup>

- Former prosecutor and barangay chairperson
- 3 September 2017: Shot several times by unidentified men in Mandaluyong City
- Perpetrators unidentified
- Motive unknown
- Eastern Police District ("**EPD**") director Chief Superintendent Romulo Sapitula confirmed that Gahol was not on the EPD's drug watchlist.

#### **20.** Reymund Luna<sup>42</sup>

- Quezon assistant provincial prosecutor
- 29 September 2017: Gunned down by motorcycle-riding men in Infanta, Quezon
- Justice Secretary Vitaliano Aguirre II has ordered the National Bureau of Investigation ("**NBI**") to investigate the killing of Luna
- Motive unknown

## 21. Expectacion Baldeo<sup>43</sup>

- Lawyer; Social Security System employee
- 3 December 2017: Killed while manning her gasoline station in Tiaong, Quezon
- Her husband was also killed in 2010
- It is believed that Baldeo's death could be work-related or due to a personal grudge.

## 22. Jonah John Ungab<sup>44</sup>

- Lawyer and vice mayor of Ronda, Cebu
- 19 February 2018: Killed when unidentified gunmen opened fire at his vehicle along S Osmeña Street, Cebu City
- The IBP have formed a task force to investigate the string of attacks on lawyers in recent years
- Perpetrators unidentified
- It is believed that Ungab's death could be work-related as he was the lawyer for suspected drug lord Rolando Kerwin Espinosa Jr. and his father Rolando Espinosa Sr., which led him to be tagged as "drug protector" by Albuera police. Ungab was charged (subsequently dismissed) in respect to his relationship with Espinosa Jr.
- Ungab also served as counsel of suspected Danao City-based drug lord Alvaro "Barok" Alvaro, and controversial businessman Kenneth Dong who was tagged in the P6.4-billion shabu shipment confiscated by the Bureau of Customs.

Ex-village chief slain in ambush, Philstar, 3 Septmeber 2017, at
 https://www.philstar.com/metro/2017/09/03/1735569/ex-village-chief-slain-ambush#5YedR1Qf5GkBt2bx.99.
 NBI to probe murder of Infanta prosecutor Luna: 7th state lawyer killed under Duterte, Abogado, 14 June 2019, at https://abogado.com.ph/nbi-to-probe-murder-of-infanta-prosecutor-luna-7th-state-lawyer-killed-under-duterte/.

 <sup>43</sup> SSS lawyer shot dead, Philstar, 4 December 2017, at https://www.philstar.com/nation/2017/12/04/1765308/sss-lawyer-shot-dead#G4uikc6bkf1lhVp1.99.
 44 Another slain prosecutor becomes 10th killed since 2016, Interaksyon, 5 June 2018, at http://www.interaksyon.com/breaking-news/2018/06/05/128149/another-slain-prosecutor-becomes-10th-killed-since-2016/; Another slain prosecutor becomes 10th killed since 2016, Cebu Daily News, 19 February 2018, at https://cebudailynews.inquirer.net/164389/jonnah-john-ungab.

#### 23. Henry Joseph Herrera

- Lawyer
- 22 April 2018: Killed when his vehicle was ambushed by unidentified gunmen in Atimonan, Quezon
- Perpetrators unidentified
- Motive unknown

## 24. Ramy Tagnong<sup>45</sup>

- Lawyer; Chief of the Calabarzon police legal affairs office
- 4 May 2018: Killed after being ambushed in vehicle in Antipolo City, Rizal
- A special task force led by Rizal PPO's Senior Supt. Noli Bathan has been formed to investigate Tagnong's killing.
- Perpetrators unidentified
- It is believed that Tagnong's death may have been work-related as he was a legal officer who reviewed administrative cases of erring policemen.

## 25. Rogelio Velasco<sup>46</sup>

- Assistant Prosecutor
- 11 May 2018: Killed after being ambushed in his vehicle at Don Antonio Heights, Quezon City
- Investigation by local police; separate NBI investigation
- Three police officers, Mr. Lalimarmo, Mr. Lucy, and Mr.Mercado face murder allegations that are denied by the suspects
- NBI Death Investigation Division recommended murder charges against other unidentified individuals
- Prosecution pending
- is believed that Velasco's death could be work-related as the city's chief inquest prosecutor.

## **26.** Geronimo Marabe Jr<sup>47</sup>

- Retired prosecutor
- 22 May 2018: Killed by unidentified riding-in-tandem men in Ozamiz City

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>45</sup> Lawyer, guard shot dead inside Cainta subdivision, Inquirer.net, 5 May 2018, at https://newsinfo.inquirer.net/987702/pnp-region-iv-a-legal-officer-shot-dead-partner-injured.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>46</sup> NBI files murder raps vs cops over killing of QC fiscal, Philstar, 10 September 2018, at https://www.philstar.com/nation/2018/09/10/1850311/nbi-files-murder-raps-vs-cops-over-killing-qc-fiscal; 3 cops deny hand in QC prosecutor's slay, ABS-CBN news, 20 February 2019, at https://news.abs-cbn.com/news/02/20/19/3-cops-deny-hand-in-qc-prosecutors-slay; DOJ says murder of QC prosecutor Rogelio Velasco 'solved', GMA News, 10 September 2018, at

https://www.gmanetwork.com/news/news/metro/667148/doj-says-murder-of-qc-prosecutor-rogelio-velasco-solved/story/; Lawyers: Slain QC deputy prosecutor was a good man, 'bahay-trabaho lang', Inquirer.net, 15 May 2018, at https://newsinfo.inquirer.net/991005/lawyers-slain-qc-deputy-prosecutor-was-a-good-man-bahay-trabaho-lang.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>47</sup> Parojinog lawyer gunned down in Ozamiz, SunStar Manila, 22 May 2018, at https://www.sunstar.com.ph/article/1744352.

- Perpetrators unidentified
- He served as public prosecutor for several cases involving the Parojinog family who are currently detained on drug and illegal possession of firearms charges. Their parents, Ozamiz City mayor Reynaldo Parojinog Sr. (on the government's drug watchlist) and Susan Parojinog, were among the 15 persons killed in a raid on the Parojinog compound in Ozamiz on July 30, 2017.

## 27. Madonna Joy Ednaco Tanyag<sup>48</sup>

- Assistant special prosecutor at the Office of the Ombudsman
- 4 June 2018: Stabbed in front of a lottery outlet along Visayas Avenue in Quezon City
- QCPD's Criminal Investigation and Detection Unit
- Suspect Mr. Avenido was arrested but was killed after allegedly trying to snatch the gun of his police escort in July 2018. It is alleged that he robbed and killed Tanyag so he could get enough money for drugs
- Robbery and other motives are being investigated;
- It is not believed that Tanyag's death was work-related.

## 28. Ricky Begino<sup>49</sup>

- Judge
- 12 June 2018: Killed while on his way home in San Jose-Lagonoy, Camarines Sur
- Invesigation by Philippines National Police
- Suspect Mr. Wilfredo Armea, was arrested the following day
- It is believed that Begino's death was over a land dispute with his parents.

## 29. Joey Galit<sup>50</sup>

- Lawyer
- 21 June 2018: Ambushed inside his subdivision in Cainta, Rizal
- Senior Supt. Lou Evangelista, Rizal police director, has also formed a special task group to look into this case.
- Perpetrators unidentified
- It is believed that Galit's death could be work-related as he handled sensitive cases in Cainta, Rizal province, and as far as Romblon and Palawan.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>48</sup> Ombudsman prosecutor slay may be 'robbery gone wrong' – QCPD, Rappler, 5 June 2018, at https://www.rappler.com/nation/204102-prosecutor-madonna-joy-ednaco-tanyag-stabbing-motive-robbery; 'A life well-lived': Sorority sisters pay tribute to slain Ombudsman prosecutor Madonna Joy Tanyag, Rappler, 7 June 2018 at https://www.rappler.com/nation/204264-madonna-joy-tanyag-profile-sorority-sisters; Foreign lawyers probe killing of 2 Negros lawyers, Manila Bulletin, 18 March 2019, at https://news.mb.com.ph/2019/03/18/foreign-lawyers-probe-killing-of-2-negros-lawyers/; IBP-NegOcc slams killing of Sagay farmers' lawyer, Philippine News Agency, 8 November 2018, at http://www.pna.gov.ph/articles/1053307.

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>49</sup> PNP arrests suspect in Camarines Sur judge Begino's slay, 3<sup>rd</sup> update, Rappler, 13 June 2018, at https://www.rappler.com/nation/204805-pnp-arrests-wilfredo-armea-suspect-ricky-begino-killing
 <sup>50</sup> Lawyer, guard shot dead inside Cainta subdivision, Inquirer.net, 22 June 2018, at https://newsinfo.inquirer.net/1003188/lawyer-guard-shot-dead-inside-cainta-subdivision; Groups denounce killing of lawyer in Davao del Norte, 3<sup>rd</sup> update, Rappler, 15 March 2019, at https://www.rappler.com/nation/225787-groups-denounce-lawyer-rex-lopoz-killing-march-2019.

#### 30. Salvador Solima<sup>51</sup>

- Lawyer; Former assistant city prosecutor, but was dismissed for gross misconduct and grave abuse of authority
- 2 July 2018: Killed when unidentified gunmen barged into his home in Cebu City
- Perpetrators unidentified
- It is believed that Solima's death could be work-related as he handled controversial cases, including those involving illegal drugs.

#### 31. Rafael Atutubo<sup>52</sup>

- Lawyer
- 23 August 2018: Gunned down by unidentified men wearing bonnets in Bacolod City Lawyer Johannes Gaasheek from the Netherlands led the team that is looking into the death
- Foreign lawyers from United States, Belgium, South Korea, and Japan also had a dialogue with the IBP
- Office had formed a SITG to investigate and speed up the resolution of the Atotubo case, but no suspect has been charged until now
- Perpetrators unidentified
- The delegation is expected to present its findings to international lawyer organizations and one of the agencies of the UN
- It is believed that Atutubo's death could be work-related as he worked as a defense attorney of illegal drug suspects. Reportedly, he was advised to get a bodyguard as he was handling drug related cases.
- Atutubo was an advocate against corruption in the judiciary and the police.

#### **32.** Connie Villamor<sup>53</sup>

- Lawyer
- 24 September 2018: Killed by unidentified gunmen while onboard her vehicle in Tagum City, Davao del Norte
   A SITG of Davao del Norte PNP has been set up
- It is believed that Villamor's death could be work-related or a personal grudge.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>51</sup> Gunmen pretended as clients: Lawyer killed, wife wounded, The Freeman, July 3 2018, at https://www.philstar.com/the-freeman/cebu-news/2018/07/03/1830165/gunmen-pretended-clients-lawyer-killed-wife-wounded#8cqiy5ehg43JYsDB.99.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>52</sup> Foreign lawyers probe killing of 2 Negros lawyer, Manila Bulletin, 18 March 2019, at https://news.mb.com.ph/2019/03/18/foreign-lawyers-probe-killing-of-2-negros-lawyers/; IBP-NegOcc slams killing of Sagay farmers' lawyer, Philippine News Agency, 8 November 2018, at http://www.pna.gov.ph/articles/1053307; Assassins gun down Bacolod lawyer, The Manila Times, 24 August 2018, at https://www.manilatimes.net/assassins-gun-down-bacolod-lawyer/433818/; Lawyer killed-*Victim handled drug case*, Panay News, 24 August 2018, at https://www.panaynews.net/lawyer-killed/.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>53</sup> Personal grudge, work-related issue seen in Tagum lawyer's killing, Inquirer.net, 24 September 2018, at https://newsinfo.inquirer.net/1035610/personal-grudge-work-related-issue-seen-in-tagum-lawyers-killing.

## 33. Edeljulio Romero<sup>54</sup>

- Lawyer
- 28 September 2018: Gunned down in Barangay Culasi in Roxas City, Capiz
- It is believed that Romero's death could be work-related as he was the lawyer of alleged drug lord Melvin Odicta Sr. and other drug-personalities.
- Police Regional Office-6 Director, Chief Superintendent John Bulalacao confirmed that Romero was considered a high value target Level 3 drug personality.

#### 34. Edmundo Pintac<sup>55</sup>

- Judge
- 8 October 2018: Shot dead by motorcycle-riding suspects in Barangay Banadero in Ozamiz City
- PNP has created a SITG to investigate
- Local police told Rappler that the Parojinog siblings are now persons of interest in the killing of Mr. Pintac
- It is believed that Pintec's death could be work-related as he was the judge that handled the drug and firearms cases against Ozamiz Vice Mayor Nova Princess Parojinog and her brother Reynaldo Parojinog Jr before these cases were transferred to a Quezon City court earlier in 2018 and other high-profile cases that he was handling prior to his death.

## **35.** Benjamin Ramos<sup>56</sup>

- Lawyer; Secretary-general of the Negros Occidental arm of the National Union of Peoples' Lawyers; Human rights defender

- 6 November 2018: Shot dead by riding-in-tandem assailants in Kabankalan City
- Lawyer Johannes Gaasheek from the Netherlands led the team that is looking into the death
- Foreign lawyers from United States, Belgium, South Korea, and Japan also had a dialogue with the IBP
- Investigation on the Ramos case is ongoing
- The delegation is expected to present its findings to international lawyer organizations and one of the agencies of the UN
- It is believed that Ramos' death could be work-related as he had previously provided legal assistance to the families of the victims of the 'Sagay 9 massacre', which

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>54</sup> In Roxas City: Odicta lawyer killed, Philstar, 30 September 2018, at https://www.philstar.com/the-freeman/region/2018/09/30/1856039/roxas-city-odicta-lawyer-killed.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>55</sup> PNP creates task group to probe murder of Ozamiz City judge, Inquirer.net, 9 October 2018, at https://newsinfo.inquirer.net/1040678/pnp-creates-task-group-to-probe-murder-of-ozamiz-city-judge?utm\_expid=.XqNwTug2W6nwDVUSgFJXed.1; Police look into slain judge's high-profile cases, SunStar, 9 October 2018, at https://www.sunstar.com.ph/article/1768447.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>56</sup> Foreign lawyers probe killing of 2 Negros lawyers, Manila Bulletin, 18 March 2019, at https://news.mb.com.ph/2019/03/18/foreign-lawyers-probe-killing-of-2-negros-lawyers/; http://www.pna.gov.ph/articles/1053307; Lawyer Benjamin Ramos shot and killed, Lawyers for lawyers, 26 November 2018, at https://lawyersforlawyers.org/en/lawyer-benjamin-ramos-shot-and-killed/; Philippine Lawyer who resisted Duterte's drug war is gunned down, The New York Times, 7 November 2018, at https://www.nytimes.com/2018/11/07/world/asia/philippine-lawyer-duterte.html.

involved the killing of nine sugarcane farmers from the National Federation of Sugar Workers by unidentified armed men on 20 October 2018 in Negros Occidental and other cases relating to poor clients whose families have been targeted by the police, soldiers and death squads associated with the president's drug war.

- The National Union of People's Lawyers have said Ramos' work had angered local policemen and the military.
- Ramos' picture was included by local police in a list of people accused of having ties to the underground communist movement, a claim that the group has been denied.

## 36. Laban, Nasser M.<sup>57</sup>

- Lawyer and peace advocate
- December 2018: shot dead by an unidentified gunman while inside a passenger van traveling from Tacurong City to Cotabato City Maguindanao
- Motive not known,

#### 37. Batocabe, Rodel<sup>58</sup>

- Lawyer and Congressman running for mayor of the town of Daraga
- 22 December 2018: shot dead by two men at Daraga Town, Albay, Luzon
- Philippine National Police alleged that the incumbent mayor Carlwyn Baldo was the mastermind of the killing, which the suspect denies. Police charged Mr. Baldo with the murder 22 December 2019;
- Arrest warrant for the suspect issued May 2019, but not served due to possible evasion of service by the suspect.

#### 38. Mary Ann Castro<sup>59</sup>

- Prosecutor (formerly in Cebu City and recently transferred to Masbate City)

- 17 January 2019: Ambushed and shot dead while driving Cebu City.

- Police indicate possible motives ranged from personal grudge, family conflict, her work as prosecutor or her involvement with a person linked to illegal drugs.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>57</sup> IAPL Monitoring Committee on Attacks on Lawyers, The Philippines: Lawyer shot dead inside passenger van in Maguindanao, 6 December 2918, at https://defendlawyers.wordpress.com/2018/12/07/the-philippines-lawyer-shot-dead-inside-passenger-van-in-maguindanao/.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>58</sup>Mara Cepeda, Who is Rodel Batocabe?, Rappler, 23 December 2018, at https://www.rappler.com/nation/219476-rodel-batocabe-profile; Patricia Lourdes Viray,Batocabe kin willing to place witness under protection, Philstar, 24 December 2018, at https://www.philstar.com/headlines/2018/12/24/1879616/batocabe-kin-willing-place-witness-under-protection; Rhaydz Barcia, Police launch manhunt for Daraga Mayor Carlwyn Baldo, Rappler, 7 May 2019, at

https://www.rappler.com/nation/229872-police-manhunt-carlwyn-baldo-may-6-2019. 
<sup>59</sup> Ador Vincent Mayol and Futch Anthony Inso, Benjie B. Talisic, Who wanted Mary Ann Castro dead?, Cebu Daily News, 18 January 2019, at https://cebudailynews.inquirer.net/212810/who-wanted-mary-ann-castro-dead; Futch Inso, Prosecutor Mary Ann Castro shot, killed in Cebu City, Cebo Daily News, 17 January 2019, at https://cebudailynews.inquirer.net/212799/prosecutor-mary-ann-castro-shot-killed-in-cebucity.

## **39.** Chairmaine Pelalyo Mejia<sup>60</sup>

- Lawyer
- 26 March 2019: stabbed to death by an unidentified assailant after getting out of her car in front of an apartment-hotel in Las Piñas City, Metro Manila, where she had agreed to meet someone: suspect fled on a motorcycle
- Police interviewed in newspaper indicated robbery as possible motive.

## **40.** Rex Jasper Lopoz<sup>61</sup>

- Lawyer
- 13 March 2019: Unidentified gunmen shot Lopez outside a shopping mall in Tagum City
- Investigators believe that a sniper positioned several meters away killed Lopez
- Perpetrators unidentified
- Lopoz's family believe that his death could be work-related as he was representing defendants in drug cases and that his murder was linked to the Duterte administration's war on drugs.

## 41. Reymar Lacaya<sup>62</sup>

- Judge
- 9 May 2019: Gunman shot Lacaya on his way home to a neighbouring town in Mindanao from the courthouse

## 42. Val Crisostomo<sup>63</sup>

- Lawyer
- 17 May 2019: shot dead by a gunman who fired several shots at him in front of the Justice Hall in Bonuan Tondaligan Dagupan City.

 $<sup>^{60}</sup>$  Ghio Ong, Lawyer stabbed dead in Las Piñas, The Philippine Star, 28 March 2019, at https://www.philstar.com/nation/2019/03/28/1905108/lawyer-stabbed-dead-las-pias.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>61</sup> Groups denounce killing of lawyer in Davao del Norte, Rappler, March 15 2019, at https://www.rappler.com/nation/225787-groups-denounce-lawyer-rex-lopoz-killing-march-2019; Philippine Lawyer Possible Victim of 'Drug War' Murder, Human Rights Watch, 15 March 2019, at https://www.hrw.org/news/2019/03/15/philippine-lawyer-possible-victim-drug-war-murder.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>62</sup> Judge shot dead in Zamboanga del Norte: Judge Reymar Lacaya of Sindangan, Zamboanga del Norte, is the fifth judge killed under the Duterte administration, Rappler, 9 May 2019, at https://www.rappler.com/nation/230110-judge-shot-dead-zamboanga-del-norte-may-9-2019.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>63</sup> Two lawyers killed in separate incidents: Adilberto Golla Jr was killed Rodriguez, Rizal, while Val Crisostomo was ambushed in Dagupan, Pangasinan, Rappler, 3<sup>rd</sup> update, 18 May 2019, at https://www.rappler.com/nation/230959-adilberto-golla-jr-gunned-down-rodriguez-rizal-may-18-2019; Lawyer shot dead in Dagupan City, Philippine News Agency, 17 May 2019, at https://www.pna.gov.ph/articles/1070101

## 43. Adilberto Golla Jr<sup>64</sup>

- Lawyer
- 17 May 2019: shot while he was on his way to work near his home in Rodriguez, Rizal.
- defense council for 10 policemen included in the dozens accused in the 2009 "Mindanao massacre"

#### Other murders, attempted murders and abduction-disappearance

In addition to the above-named persons, the following three legal workers have been murdered:

- **Randel Villaruz**, Clerk of regional trial court, murdered 1 October 2018 at Batac City, Ilocos Norte, Luzon;
- **Edwin Pura**, paralegal, murdered 26 October 2017 at Gubat, Sorsogon, Luzon;
- **Mariam Uy Acob**, paralegal, murdered 23 September 2018 at Mamasapano, Maguindanao, Mindanao.

The following lawyer has been abducted and disappeared:

- **Alwyn Mendoza**, lawyer, abducted and disappeared 23 February 2019 at Cabanatuan City, Nueva Ecija, Luzon

The following nine jurists have survived murderous attacks:

- Nasser Abinal, lawyer, attacked 5 May 2017 in Quiapo, Metro Manila;
- Ron Ely Esponsa, lawyer, attacked August 2017 in Sorsogon City, Sorsogon, Luzon;
- Argel Cabatbat, lawyer, attacked 13 Febuary 2018 in Quezon City, Metro Manila;
- Wilmer Donasco, lawyer, attacked 26 September 2018 in Ecoland, Davao City, Mindanao;
- Erfe Del Castillo, lawyer, attacked 22 December 2018 in Talisay City, Negros Occidental:
- Manuel Tesiorna, prosecutor, attacked 6 February 2017 at Surigao City, Surigao del Norte, Mindanao
- Jesephone C. Olivar, prosecutor, attacked 10 June 2019

<sup>64</sup> Lawyer shot dead in front of Dagupan City Justice Hall, Inquirer.net, 17 May 2019, at https://newsinfo.inquirer.net/1120201/lawyer-shot-dead in-front-of-dagupan-city-justice-hall; Two lawyers killed in separate incidents: Adilberto Golla Jr was killed Rodriguez, Rizal, while Val Crisostomo was ambushed in Dagupan, Pangasinan, Rappler, 3<sup>rd</sup> update, 18 May 2019, at

https://www.rappler.com/nation/230959-adilberto-golla-jr-gunned-down-rodriguez-rizal-may-18-2019.